

SVENSKA INSTITUTEN I ATHEN OCH ROM
INSTITUTUM ATHENIENSE ATQUE INSTITUTUM ROMANUM REGNI SUECIAE

Opuscula

Annual of the Swedish Institutes at Athens and Rome

8
2015

STOCKHOLM

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE:

Prof. Gunnel Ekroth, Uppsala, Chairman
Prof. Arne Jönsson, Lund, Vice-chairman
Ms Kristina Björkstén Jersén, Stockholm, Treasurer
Dr Erika Weiberg, Uppsala, Secretary
Prof. Peter M. Fischer, Göteborg
MA Axel Frejman, Uppsala
Dr Kristian Göransson, Rome
Prof. Karin Blomqvist, Lund
Prof. Arja Karivieri, Stockholm
Dr Emilie Karlsmo, Uppsala
Prof. Anne-Marie Leander Touati, Lund
Dr Arto Penttinen, Athens

EDITOR:

Dr Jenni Hjohlman
Department of Archaeology and Classical Studies
Stockholm University
SE-106 91 Stockholm
editor@ecsi.se

SECRETARY'S ADDRESS:

Department of Archaeology and Ancient History
Uppsala University
Box 626
SE-751 26 Uppsala
secretary@ecsi.se

DISTRIBUTOR:

eddy.se ab
Box 1310
SE-621 24 Visby

For general information, see www.ecsi.se
For subscriptions, prices and delivery, see <http://ecsi.bokorder.se>

Published with the aid of a grant from The Swedish Research Council
The English text was revised by Rebecca Montague, Hindon, Salisbury, UK

Opuscula is a peer reviewed journal. Contributions to *Opuscula* should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee before 1 November every year. Contributors are requested to include an abstract summarizing the main points and principal conclusions of their article. For style of references to be adopted, see www.ecsi.se/guides-contributors. Books for review should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee.

ISSN 2000-0898
ISBN 978-91-977798-7-6
© Svenska Institutet i Athen and Svenska Institutet i Rom
Printed by Elanders, Sverige AB, Mölnlycke 2015
Cover illustration from Fischer, this volume p. 73 & 75.

law was still valid, and Socrates as yet unpunished for his alleged offences.

Before the conclusion of the book the highly interesting Chapter 9 is followed by two further chapters (10–11), dealing with the emerging effects of the original settlement and the fulfillment of these with the final settlement of 401 BC. Both chapters build on speeches preserved in the Lysianic corpus and are clearly meant for drawing out the consequences of the third of the book's main theses regarding the reconciliation: that it brought with it a new sense of contractual obligation pertaining to the law. Chapter 10 deals with the speech against the law-inscriber Nicomachus and is intended to offer a glance of "the emerging regime of the laws", while Chapter 11 is working through Lysias's epitaphic oratory to establish the awakening of the awareness of laws understood as a "binding agreement".

All in all, Edwin Carawan's book stands as a sincere effort to resolve the problems connected with the "Athenian Amnesty". As already mentioned, however, in most chapters scholarly detail clearly outweighs questions of more general interest. Another way of approaching the same topic would have been, for example, to focus more clearly throughout the book on the developments in "legal thinking" merely hinted at in the majority of the chapters. Chapter 9, however, can be highlighted as an outstanding example of scholarship pertaining to the ever-relevant question of why the Athenians put Socrates to death.

OTTO LINDERBORG
Department of Linguistics and Philology
Uppsala university
Box 635
751 26 UPPSALA
otto.linderborg@lingfil.uu.se

Daughters of Hecate: Women and magic in the ancient world, ed. Kimberly B. Stratton with Dayna S. Kalleres, Oxford: Oxford University Press 2014. 552 pp. ISBN 0-19-534271-2.

Daughters of Hecate is a collection of 15 chapters examining the social, political, literary, and cultural forces that inform the construction of gender and the practice of magic in the ancient Eastern Mediterranean. The contributions range from ancient Greek and Roman examples to Biblical Jewish and Early Christian ones. In her introduction, Stratton writes that she began exploring the subject with "the expectation that women were more often represented and accused of magic than men were in ancient writings, and [she] sought an explanation for this bias" (p. 1). But as the work developed, she found that the evidence did not support this at all. The notion that when men do it, it is medicine and religion and is to be

lauded, but when women do, it is witchcraft and magic and should be punished, turned out not to hold. What emerges over the course of the 15 chapters is a relationship between women and magic that defies easy categorization, stereotypes, or binary power relationships; the value of the collection, then, lies not only in its insights for those interested in the historical, literary, and social construction of women and magic, but also as a case study for how to reappraise source material when it no longer lends itself to outdated ideas.

The principal evidentiary source for ancient culture in the Eastern Mediterranean is the written record, a record composed, preserved, and, until recently, analysed exclusively by men. The application of feminist theory to these texts has rightly shown how the ingrained misogyny of ancient writers (and, if to a lesser degree, modern scholars) warps their perceptions of both women as represented in the texts and also of their actual lived experience. Consequently, previous scholars have made the mistake, in Stratton's words, of "accept[ing] the representation of women's magic at face value and us[ing] it to reconstruct women's actual ritual practices" (p. 5) while ignoring the inherent unreliability of such sources in speaking about women's lives. Rather than offering an actual picture of women's practice of magic, then, scholarship after feminism reveals that what such texts actually offer is a picture of how male writers imagined women's practice of magic. Each of the three sections in this volume provide a different methodological corrective to this practice.

Part I, 'Fiction and fantasy: Gendering magic in ancient literature', examines how, because of their own ideological biases, ancient authors distorted the picture of actual magical practices. In the opening chapter of the section, 'From goddess to hag: The Greek and Roman witch in classical literature', Barbette Stanley Spaeth makes clear the limits of the literary sources: "It is important to recognize that these representations do not necessarily reflect reality; they probably do not tell us much about actual witches ... we should not read these literary portraits naively, as pointing towards the reality of the practice of magic" (p. 43). Rather, she argues that they "can reveal much about how the societies of classical antiquity thought about the cognitive category of 'witch'" (p. 43). A feminist perspective sheds light on the patriarchal ideologies which define the term and the position of those to whom it is applied. The witch can help us understand how the categories of "woman" and "magic" operate in the male imaginary. A similar subject is addressed in the second chapter, Rebecca Lesses's "'The most worthy of women is a mistress of magic': Women as witches in *I Enoch* and Rabbinic sources". Though dealing with the Biblical Jewish tradition, Lesses asks similar questions: "What do we learn about these sources' discourses of women from the way they refer to them as witches? Do these discourses bear any relation to women's actual use

of amulets, spells, and healing practices?" (p. 71). Indeed, though the four chapters in this section deal with works from different periods and places, their conclusions are remarkably similar: the depiction of witches reflects male sexual fears and fantasies about women, about gender boundaries and their transgression, about power and who wields it, and about the dangers presented by women and the natural world.

If the chapters in Part I are concerned with the ways literary depictions of witches were distorted by patriarchal discourse, those in Part II, 'Gender and magic discourse in practice', seek to analyse such texts from a more critically aware perspective to see just what can be known about the practice of witchcraft. Elizabeth Ann Pollard's 'Magic accusations against women in Tacitus' *Annals*', for instance, looks through Tacitus's rhetorical depiction of trials ("Tacitus achieves more than merely the completion of his overall negative portrait of women in positions of power" [p. 184]) and finds a sociological purpose for witchcraft allegations: "to help negotiate competitive and unregulated relationships between women of power", "to allow contemporary observers to deal with a group of people who are suddenly in an unexpected position of power", and "to allow for the realignment of factional hierarchy amongst noble families" (pp. 184–185). Dayna Kalleres's 'Drunken hags with amulets and prostitutes with erotic spells: The re-feminization of magic in Late Antique Christian homilies' is also sociological, seeing in "images of female magical practice ... discursive objects marking an Other, which measured the inverse construction of proper Christian identity both ritually and socially" (p. 220). Magic, she argues, was a way for the Church to exert control over the many new adherents of their faith, each with their own preceding religious traditions. By calling something magic and thus criminal and proscribed, the church eliminated previous (pagan, often polytheistic) ritual practices and diminished the role of women in the sacred sphere. Ayşe Tuzlak's 'The bishop, the pope, and the prophetess: Rival ritual experts in third-century Cappadocia' offers a similarly feminist sociology. As in the previous chapter, Tuzlak argues that witchcraft is a constantly shifting social paradigm, evoked and constructed to address how "contemporary anxieties about possession, agency, gender, and sexuality could play into debates regarding ritual expertise and sacramental efficacy" (p. 253). Again, witchcraft appears only to be censured, and the whats, wheres, whens, and hows of its censure reveal the patriarchal ideologies of anxiety and control about women and nature. Nowhere is this theme made clearer than in Kirsti Barrett Copeland's 'Sorceresses and sorcerers in Early Christian tours of hell': when surveying Dante's sorceresses in hell, "the pilgrim is instructed to look at these women who did not practice the appropriate feminine arts of sewing, weaving, and spinning yarn" (p. 299). This is magic as a means of social control: when women behave in ways sanctioned by patriar-

chy (such as, for instance, the devout humility of Beatrice), they go to heaven; when they behave in ways of which Dante and the (male) Catholic authorities disapprove, they go to hell.

How, then, can we actually know about women's magical practice given the attendant problems of literature under patriarchy and given that much (perhaps most) magic was never accounted for in the literary record at all? Part III, 'Gender, magic, and the material record' solves both of these problems. The material record, it turns out, is one of very few places where we can actually hear female magicians speaking in their own voice. David Frankfurter's 'The social context of women's erotic magic in antiquity', for instance, reproduces the texts of spells found on binding tablets, funerary inscriptions, and other magical objects. What these objects show is the diversity of female experiences, sexual desires, and the expression of both public and private identities and the social constraints which helped shape them. Pauline Ripat's 'Cheating women: Curse tablets and Roman wives' and Fritz Graf's 'Victimology or: How to deal with untimely death', both examine how women behaved in family circumstances, as wives, mothers, and daughters, or, as in AnneMarie Luijendijk's chapter 'A gospel amulet for Joannia (P.Oxy. VIII 1151)', simply as any other member of society attempting to find release from physical ailments.

In the end, this volume showcases the strengths of interdisciplinary approaches to the ancient world: equal parts literary studies, art history, archaeology, and cultural studies. Each contribution demonstrates the strengths and limitations of one of these fields for understanding life in antiquity. Taken together, they provide as detailed a glimpse into the ancient world as we, two millennia removed, could hope to find.

ADAM J. GOLDWYN
Department of English
North Dakota State University
NDSU, Dept. 2320
P.O. Box 6050
Fargo, ND 58108
USA
adam.goldwyn@ndsu.edu